Communication and violence: The image of the minor in the press photographs of the ETA attacks

Comunicación y violencia: La imagen del menor en las fotografías de prensa de los atentados de ETA

Nekane Parejo.

Universidad de Málaga. Spain.

nekane@uma.es

(D) [8] (C) [P]

Agustín Gómez Gómez.

Universidad de Málaga. Spain.

aggomez@uma.es

10 g 6 P

This article is part of the Advanced Audiovisual Content research group, financed by the Andalusian Board SEJ-435

How to cite this article / Normalized reference

Parejo, N. & Gómez Gómez, A. (2020). Communication and violence: The image of the minor in the press photographs of the ETA attacks. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 80, 435-451. https://www.doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2022-1814

RESUMEN

Introducción: La cobertura fotográfica de los atentados de ETA por parte de la prensa ha contado con diversos sujetos entre los que destacan las víctimas, pero también hay espacio para el asesino, los periodistas, los testigos y los espectadores. Esta investigación focalizará su atención en los menores de edad, especialmente en la evolución de su representación. De forma más específica pretendemos estudiar los espacios en los que se les sitúa, para posteriormente establecer la asiduidad con la que se les registra, el protagonismo con el que cuentan en el encuadre y los roles que ejercen. Metodología: Estos objetivos han implicado el uso del análisis de contenido en su versión cualitativa. Para ello se ha delimitado una muestra que ha incluido seis cabeceras —La Gaceta del Norte, Hierro, El Correo, Deia, Egin y El País— durante un periodo de 30 años, desde 1968 hasta 1997, fecha del atentado de Miguel Ángel Blanco Villar. En este recorrido se han establecido tres categorías: las imágenes de archivo, las de los funerales y las del lugar del atentado. Discusión y resultados: Se detecta un modelo de representación cíclico donde el menor es omitido en los inicios para cobrar un protagonismo inusitado a partir de 1976 y posteriormente desaparecer nuevamente de las fotografías. Conclusiones: En función de las categorías establecidas se observa el desempeño de diferentes roles como pueden ser la identificación, el espectador en la imagen, el niño que indica el lugar del suceso, el testigo o el depositario de símbolos.

PALABRAS CLAVE: niños; atentados; ETA; prensa; fotografía; violencia; terrorismo.

ABSTRACT

Introduction: The photographic coverage of the ETA attacks by the press has had various subjects, among which the victims stand out, but there is also room for the murderer, the journalists, the witnesses and the spectators. This research will focus its attention on minors, especially in the representation of their evolution. More specifically, we intend to study the spaces in which they are located, to later establish the frequency with which they are recorded, the prominence they have in the frame and the roles they play. **Methodology:** These objectives have involved the use of content analysis in its qualitative version. To this end, a sample has been delimited that has included six newspapers – *La Gaceta del Norte, Hierro, El Correo, Deia Egin* and *El País* – over a period of 30 years, from 1968 to 1997, the date of the attack by Miguel Ángel Blanco Villar. In this tour, three categories have been established: archive images, those of funerals and those of the place of the attack. **Discussion and results:** A cyclical model of representation is detected where the minor is omitted at the beginning to gain an unusual prominence from 1976 and later disappear again from the photographs. **Conclusions:** Depending on the established categories, the performance of different roles is observed, such as identification, the spectator in the image, the child who indicates the place of the event, the witness or the repository of symbols.

KEYWORDS: Children; Attack; ETA; Press; Photography; Violence; Terrorism.

Translation by Paula González (Universidad Católica Andrés Bello, Venezuela)

1. Introduction

The relationship between the ETA attacks and their graphic media coverage by the press could be placed in 1968. In the words of Sara Hidalgo: "the year in which this happens is not trivial, 1968, when the so-called 'third wave of terrorism' began worldwide, to which a group of young Basques who had founded ETA a few years before got hooked" (2018, p. 157). Precisely the first victim of the gang, the Traffic Civil Guard José Pardines, died on June 7th, 1968. However, it will not be until the murder of the policeman¹ and head of the Political-Social Brigade of Guipúzcoa, Melitón Manzanas (August 2nd, 1968) that the newspapers published the first images.

Four years later, in 1972, the presence of a minor in the press is detected for the first time through a photograph rescued from the family album of the victim, the civil guard Eloy García. As of 1976, the figure of the minor forms part of the frames of the place of the event. However, the formulas used have been changing in the 30 years under study in this research, which includes from 1968 to 1997.

The academy has dedicated a large part of its research to the study of ETA terrorism in a generic way and jointly with other gangs (Avilés, 2010; Reinares, 2018), but above all, the different moments in which the dissolution of the gang has been raised until its definitive disappearance have aroused interest (González, 2018; Alonso, 2005; Domínguez, 2007).

Many works reveal the modes of representation of the conflict, either through cinema (Marcos, 2011; Vicente, 2020), television (Marcos, 2021), or the daily press. Among the latter are those that analyze

Received: 17/05/2022. **Accepted:** 04/07/2022. **Published:** 23/07/2022.

¹ It is necessary to remember that the code of ethics on the graphic treatment of the image of the policemen fluctuated depending on the newspaper in which the image was published and the historical period. In this sense, see (Parejo, 2004, pp. 388-395). Finally: "The Spanish Partido Popular took advantage of its parliamentary majority to approve a law promoted by the Minister of Internal Affairs Jorge Fernández Díaz that penalized up to 30,000 euros for photographing the police under certain conditions" (Soriano, 2019, p. 245).

the newspapers of our sample (Armentia et al., 2012, pp, 152-154), those that examine their editorial houses (Caminos-Marcet et al., 2013), or those that address the novel proposals of the newspapers *El País*, *Deia*, and *Egin* (Fernández Bañuelos, 1997).

Focusing on the photographs of the attacks, we must highlight the detailed record of the images of the attacks, taking into account parameters such as quantity, size, and content (García-Lafuente, 2014), which, through the study of the headlines and photographs of the covers, give an account of the evolution of the informative treatment in Spain on terrorism (Miguel-Sáez and Moreno, 2015; Morera, 2021) or those that focus their work on photographic analysis (Parejo, 2004 and 2008).

Beyond the focus of their contributions, they all agree that there is a clear link between the sample period and the formulas used by the media. From here, and although the representation of children murdered by the terrorist group ETA is not the object of study of this research, the contributions of Alonso et al. (2010); the article by Castresana (1987), and more recently, those by García Varela (2022), who have analyzed actions against minors, as well as their consequences and impact on Spanish society, have been useful.

Finally, and from a thematic perspective such as the scene of the events, the article by Veres (2021) is essential in that it focuses on this aspect and points out that "the elements surrounding the attack did not involve matters of little importance, but quite the opposite, since they became entities that generate meaning" (p. 9), and the contributions of Wollheim (1987) regarding the place where the viewer is located.

2. Objectives and methodology

The general objective of this work is to establish the evolution of the representation of the figure of minors in the photographs of the ETA attacks. From there, and specifically, the purposes are diversified into others, such as determining the spaces in which they appear portrayed, to later specify other parameters such as the roles they play, the narrative distance at which they are placed, and the frequency with which they are registered.

We start from the hypothesis that the history of the representation of minors in these attacks constitutes a cyclical narrative. To address this concept, we refer to the definition of Francesco Casetti and Federico Di Chio, when they establish that: "Cyclical time is determined by a succession of events ordered in such a way that the point of arrival of the series turns out to be analogous to the point of origin, although not identical" (2007, p. 135).

In this sense, in our object of study different periods are visualized that begin with a stage in which the concealment of the image of minors in the place of the event is prioritized to later become the protagonist and, finally, disappear again, although with certain nuances that imply that the representation is not identical.

The methodology to be followed will be the qualitative version of the content analysis. The selected photographs, without being all those that have a minor in the six selected headings, are the ones that show the evolution, those that serve to clearly show the changes that have taken place around the representation of minors. We can say that the proposed qualitative analysis, in which visual appreciations or cultural contexts are taken into consideration, represents the meaning that press photography gave them, those that mark the trends of the analyzed period, and those that allow us to take a tour of the view of society for three decades. In this sense, we identify patterns through qualitative techniques that, as Berganza and Ruiz add, are "those that, having their basis in the interpretive methodology, intend to

capture the meaning of the subjects' actions (...) capture the motives and meanings" (2010, p. 32). From this position, we move towards an approach in which the accent is placed on explanatory, descriptive analysis, and changes in forms. From here, a sample is delimited whose supports are the newspapers *La Gaceta del Norte, Hierro*, and *El Correo* (qualified as traditional) to which *El País*, *Deia*, and *Egin* will be added as representatives of the new information models that emerge with the Transition. These six newspapers are justified by the interest in covering a representative spectrum of the press in the period under study. For this reason, all the newspapers in the Basque Country where the germ of this research is located have been included. Additionally, an attempt has been made to cover an ideological arc in which the first three *-La Gaceta del Norte, Hierro*, and *El Correo*- of a more conservative nature and markedly Spanish sentiment, contrast with- Deia and Egin of nationalist and independence ideology, respectively. To complete the sample, we have added a newspaper with national coverage that emerges with an evident innovative vocation and that is committed to a renewed photographic treatment such as *El País*.

As for the time frame, it is from 1968 to 1997. This period has been established because these are two significant dates. The first, 1968, responds to the fact that it is the year in which images of an attack are found for the first time, specifically that of Melitón Manzanas. Ending in 1997 is justified because the coverage of the attack on Miguel Ángel Blanco Villar, from the perspective of photography, constitutes the largest deployment of the last three decades. On the other hand, the images of this murder suppose, from a social approach, a series of mobilizations that disrupt the notion of what the spectator was capable of expressing and, also, account for the characteristic features that have been forged in the 90s.

On the other hand, the text is articulated according to three categories in which the figure of minors is present: archive photographs, those of funerals, and those of the scenes of the events. This selection of categories finds its justification in that "The details of the attack are formed as signs of a discursive universe that acts as a mediator with the facts and adds new repercussions to the information that will be offered in the media" (Veres, 2021, p. 11). Specifically, this same author, referring to the place of the attack, points out that it is "an outstanding element that notably conditions the facts, and the choice of it is subject to symbolic aspects" (p.12).

3. Discussion and results

3.1. Archive photographs

The first attack of the 1970s was on August 29th, 1972. It was the civil guard Eloy García, who was shot dead in the Galdácano Town Hall square. The different newspapers insert innovative photographic shots compared to the previously seen content. This is the case of the newspaper *Hierro*, which places the victim in his work environment through an image in which he meets his colleagues and in which the murdered person is recognized by an X placed above his head. To these images, which connect directly with the workplace, it is necessary to add those that have family sentimental implications. In this sense, a photograph of the Communion of the victim's youngest son stands out, held in May of the same year and which opens this newspaper a day later. On the inside pages (page 4), and from a reproduction of the large family card dated 1965, we find the deceased in the company of his wife and his four children. These types of images are adjusted to a specific political context in which it is desired to promote what Bordieu qualifies as a family function, in which it is intended to: "solemnize and reinforce the integration of the group by reaffirming the feeling that it has of itself and its unity" (2003, p. 57). In a way, it is an attempt to evoke the past in which one of its members was not yet missing. On the other hand, the memory of him in life serves to "inseparably revive the memory of the disappeared and that of his disappearance, to remember that he has been alive" (Bordieu, 2003, p. 121).

On the other hand, in this decade the child has another connotation and that is to strengthen the image of the victim as a "good man". This is the case of the photograph that the newspaper *El Correo* inserts on the front page of June 23rd, 1977 on the occasion of the attack on Javier de Ybarra, in which we see him surrounded by minors in the El Salvador de Amurrio house in which groups of children receive education and of which the deceased was president of its Board of Trustees².

These photographs of the past have a commonplace that is to show a disturbing character, which increases with time. Along these same lines, *Deia* publishes a portrait of the port worker Antonio Fernández Guzmán smiling together with his two young children on September 4th, 1980. In short, during this decade these shots show the everyday situations of the victim, but with a more casual treatment. In other words, if the treatment of images in the 1970s was linked to protocol, in the 1980s a difference was established. While the former are characterized by the seriousness and rigor of the pose and are part of family events or belong to some official document, those of the 80s, although they have the same purpose, to move the viewer because the deceased shares the frame with minors show less ceremonious attitudes. This implies that there are photographs that shock us because empathy is produced in the reader.

Gradually, minors cease to be present in these types of images, which will be limited to the passport photo of the victim.

3.2. Minors in the funerals of the 1970s

For many years, the photographs of the funerals of the victims of the attacks were more numerous than the rest and it can even be said that they replaced those of the event itself³. The variations would have to be found in the content of the photo if it showed the lifeless body or, on the contrary, the lid of the coffin hid it. In this sense, the usual thing was without a lid for the parade of personalities and relatives and later placed with decorative ornamentation such as flags or medals.

Regarding the object of study, in the more traditional newspapers, it is worth highlighting the photograph published on May 20th, 1977, by *El Correo* showing the widow of police officer Manuel Orceda de la Cruz leaving the funeral with a baby, her daughter. The caption states: "When leaving the funeral of her murdered husband, Doña Clara Campos Moya, 19 years old, hugs her one-and-a-half-year-old daughter who had remained inside the car". We found a new aspect. Until the publication of this image, the children of the deceased who were portrayed were adults or their existence was known through photographs in the family album that were always linked to a previous period indeterminate in time⁴. The unusual thing is that the present is recorded. Moreover, this display of the descendant (underdog) entails a series of alien feelings up to that moment.

The *Deia* photographers work in this line, although with even closer and more emotional images. An example of this procedure can be found in the shots of the October 11th, 1977 burial of the president of the Provincial Council of Vizcaya in Guernica, Augusto Unceta. Two photographs stand out in this report,

_

² In the interior pages the information is completed with his work in eleven special education centers.

³ Let's remember that: "the turning point, which could be related to the beginning of openness about what can be seen, is marked by the image of the lifeless body of taxi driver Manuel Albizu Idiáquez in the photograph published on the cover of *La Gaceta del Norte* on March 16th, 1976. It is a medium shot in which only a slightly forward-inclined profile body can be seen on the left, from whose temple two threads of blood start" (Parejo, 2004, p. 91). It can be affirmed that it is the first assassinated person portrayed at the scene of the crime. From now on we will call the body *in situ*.

⁴ We just saw the First Communion of Eloy García's son.

that of the widow with her eight-month-old daughter and that of a minor with a distressed expression in an even closer shot. The fact that the distance to the portrayed subject is less is a highly significant factor since it allows a better distinction of her face and greater identification with the reader.

Precisely, this will be the trend that will finally prevail in the 1980s, characterized by the combination of traditional funerals with others whose defining feature will be the representation of a feeling, with a clear predominance of the latter. These are shots that are distinguished by openly showing emotions and in which other forms of visualization that we could describe as more extreme are incorporated. This is the case for those that show signs of tension or show nervousness among the attendees.

Sometimes several formulas are combined. When the attack in Vitoria on the cavalry commander Jesús Velasco Zuazola, two images of the funerals are published in *Deia* on January 11th, 1980. In the first, the minors are in the background, but this does not prevent the crying of the daughter from being appreciated, since the coffin, which is in the foreground, is out of focus. The second photograph gives all the prominence to the expressions of his wife and daughter.

The newspaper *El Correo*, which until now had shown discretion regarding the narrative distance, joined this trend the next day with two images that stand out for their expressive force. On the cover, you can see a woman whose pose resembles that of a political leader. Several factors contribute to this perception, such as the low angle, which is located at a high point, the act of shouting (the caption indicates that she is saying: "Long live Spain"), and a close-up of the rear of the heads of several teenagers who direct their gaze towards her. Inside we find another photograph in which the crying of a minor, her daughter, stands out. Next to her, other attendees can be seen with rueful gestures or with their faces covered.

As we said, the shots reproduce more and more expressive samples that make room for other actions such as fainting, attitudes of anguish, states of tension, anger, or taking advantage of the moment to express themselves. An example of this last action is found in the photograph of the wife of the industrial engineer José M^a Ryan Estrada accompanied by his two sons, edited by *Deia* on February 8th, 1981, on the occasion of his murder.

3.3. The place of the events

3.3.1. The child-spectator in the image

During the late 1960s and early 1970s, it was observed that the scene of the event was characterized by being empty. The most frequent photographs framed endless panoramas devoid of life. This is the case of *La Gaceta del Norte*, which includes on its cover of August 30th, 1972, the place of the murder of Eloy García highlighted by the text "Eloy García fell here" whichindicates the exact place. Concerning the object of research, it should be noted that on the right side, the size of the children's figures on a warning traffic sign stands out (due to the proximity of children in the vicinity of a school). Without a doubt, it is intended to strengthen the close relationship between the school and the place of the attack. In Benjamin's words: "the crime scene is deserted. It's photographed for clues" (1973, p. 32). Subsequently, and according to Morera, the link between the place of the attack and the proximity to a school will be resumed in 1991 after the attack on the Vic barracks in which 5 minors died. Specifically, that same year and on the occasion of the murder of Lieutenant Francisco Carballar Muñoz "emphasis was placed again on whether ETA kills children or if it does so near schools to further stigmatize the gang" (2021, p. 752).

Progressively, the place of the attack was filled with firefighters, health personnel, guards, journalists, etc. Subsequently, family members were photographed, and later the authorities. All of them had in common the fact of undertaking a task and their presence was justified, whether it was sentimental relationships, work, or representation tasks. Starting in 1976, these newspapers include a new figure, that of the spectator, which we can define as someone who has no other mission than to observe and has no relationship with the victim. At this point, some nuances must be made to differentiate between the two types of spectators. According to Wollheim: "There is the viewer of the image and the viewer in the image. Both are distinguished according to where they are located and what they see" (1987, p. 59). In other words, the first⁵ is the one that is not in the frame, while the viewer in the image is. This research will focus on the latter, but sometimes the viewer of the image will be referred to, to confront what content each of them has access to.

The first spectators in the image were characterized by standing in empty locations, to later give an account of how they contemplate the aftermath of the attack (pool of blood, glass, sawdust...). The usual thing was a collective registry in which children were integrated. On June 10th, 1976, *La Gaceta del Norte* published the first shot of minors along with remains (bloodstains) from the attack on the local head of the Basauri Movement, Luis Carlos Albo Llamosas. In this line, the photograph of the place where Anselmo Durán died is representative of this stage. Here, the spectators, who form a row with numerous children, are placed stacked on the buildings of a street at a certain distance from some stairs where a pool of blood can be seen. That is those present only look at the remains of the attack. From this, it follows that the viewer in the image and the viewer of the image contemplate the same contents, since other shots from a previous time in which the corpse could be seen *in situ* are not reproduced.

The aforementioned photographs show the presence of a high percentage of children among the spectators. On many occasions, they are the real protagonists. This is the case of the only two shots that illustrate the attack in Durango of the sheet metal worker Epifanio Vidal in the Egin⁶ newspaper on October 26th, 1978. The one on the cover shows two children on a sidewalk on whose curb the remains of the victim's blood can be seen. It is striking that both do not direct their gaze toward them but the camera. Furthermore, a large overlay of the deceased in the deposit has been inserted into the frame, increasing the harshness of the image. The same bloody curb is found on the inside pages, but now the protagonists are six uniformed girls of various ages, some of them very young. The snapshot gives us the reverse shot of the previous one and places the minors crowded on the left margin to include in the frame a graffiti in which amnesty is claimed and which serves as a counterpoint to what happened.

This presence of minors in the frames could be explained by three reasons: the image is more impressive if they appear at the scene of a crime (and raises questions about what they see), the fact that they are easier to convince to pose, and that at that time it was more common to find children alone in the street.

If up to now we have highlighted how the minor stood at the scene of the attack, sharing the frame with traces of blood, shockingly, although the number of these shots was reduced in the 1979-80 biennium, the bloodiest of terrorist activity, the first aspect to underline is the clear increase in photographs in which they are included and the variety of modalities, which will also be extended to traditional newspapers.

Received: 17/05/2022. **Accepted:** 04/07/2022. **Published:** 23/07/2022.

⁵ Barthes calls this *Spectator* since he is the one who observes what is recorded through the media. For more information consult Barthes (2004) and Parejo (2008, pp. 140-162).

⁶ The trajectory of the newspaper *Egin* regarding the representation of minors is characterized by presenting this content irregularly and differently from the rest of the newspapers. We appreciate this in the scarcity in the number of photographs of this theme and the highly impressive nature of these in their beginnings.

The most frequent patterns are those that include a third element, a graphic addition that highlights the precise location of the attack. We find a paradigmatic sample in *El Correo* on August 5th, 1979, on the occasion of the murder in Eibar of the civil guard Juan Tauste Sánchez. Here you can see how a minor looks at an oval that hides the blood of the deceased. Here the external spectator only has access to the aforementioned geometric figure but is aware that what the child observes are the traces of blood from the attack.

A vehicle will also be placed in the same position as the real one at the time of the event. *Deia* inserts on its cover of January 7th, 1979, on the occasion of the machine-gunning of the civil guard Antonio Ramírez Gallardo and his girlfriend Hortensia González Ruiz in Beasáin, an image in which a car has been placed at the same stop where they died. Next to the vehicle, numerous minors can be seen. On other occasions, the children increase their actions, and the viewer of the image can see them looking at the holed window of a car, as in the close-up published by *Deia* after the murder of Julio Santiago Expósito on June 21st, 1980, in Sestao.

Other typologies show other reasons such as police presence or the place where the aggressors fled. To exemplify the first, *Deia* on July 29th, 1979, portrays three minors stationed near a portal in Bilbao where the Corporal First of the National Police Miguel Ángel Saro and the agent Emilio López de la Peña died and in which the bullet holes can still be seen. At their side, the weapon carried by a policeman who captures the attention of one of them stands out. This same newspaper will give an account of the second typology on September 21st, 1980 where we find a snapshot in which various children with their bicycles stand at the door through which the aggressors of the civil guards Mariano González Huergo, Miguel Hernández Espigares, Alfonso Martínez Bellas, and Antonio García Argente left the scene of the attack in Marquina.

Shortly after, a close-up in time is seen, which shows that the photographer arrives at the scene earlier each time and that translates into the fact that the viewer in the image coincides in the shot with health workers at the moment in which they remove the deceased or with the lifeless body of the victim awaiting removal. Minors are also shown in these photographs. We highlight here, the cover of September 4th, 1980, published by *El País* where among the numerous observers, whose heads have been severed by the frame, a minor stands out, the only one whose face we can appreciate, who contemplates the sheet under which is the body *in situ* of the port worker murdered in Santurce, Antonio Fernández Guzmán.

After the 1979-80 biennium, the number of photographs in which minors are included in the scene decreased. It can be affirmed that their representation goes from being indispensable to being exceptionally registered. Furthermore, the photographed motifs are repeated, such as the two shots published by *Egin* in 1981. The first, which belongs to April 15th, picks up some minors next to the kiosk where Lieutenant Colonel Luis Cardoso San Juan was murdered. The second, from October 18th, places them next to the car that the Corporal First of the Civil Guard, Santiago González de Paz, tried to start at the moment in which some shots ended his life. Sometimes there is a setback reminiscent of earlier stages. This situation would include a shot of *La Gaceta del Norte* whose motif is the empty Avenida Sancho el Sabio in San Sebastián in which the shooting that ended the life of the provincial delegate of the National Telephone Company of Spain (CTNE) in Guipúzcoa, Enrique Cuesta Jiménez, on March 27th, 1982, took place. Although no minor can be seen in the image, the caption suggests their possible presence: "Enrique Cuesta fell mortally wounded in front of the door of a savings institution, in a place frequented by many children".

Therefore, the new formulas of representation are scarce and do not manage to configure a new archetype that is reiterated in the different newspapers. These are isolated samples, such as the fact of

registering, on the place where Luis Cardoso San Juan died, the accentuated shadows of some minors that are published in *La Gaceta del Norte* on April 14th, 1981. Or that the group shot is eventually replaced by the presence of a single child from behind. This is how we find the minor who looks at the remains of the blood of the retired civil guard Benjamín Fernández Fernández assassinated in San Sebastián, which is collected by *La Gaceta del Norte* on February 16th, 1982.

So far it has been possible to verify that the figure of minors has been part of the scene of the events as a spectator in the image from different perspectives: looking at the camera, from behind, on high points... and from different attitudes: looking around the vehicle of the victim or the weapon of a police officer, the traces of sawdust or blood... and even with the body of the murdered person under a sheet. Furthermore, it is verified that they were the protagonist when the corpse *in situ* was not present in the frames. Also, they prevailed when the bodies of the victims began to be shown in the 79-80 biennium, although, as will be seen in the next section, here its function will be more active (and it will become the marker of the scene of the events). It is striking that in this period in which the image of the corpse becomes the main content, the figure of the minor spectator shares the same space, but at different times. That is to say, there is no photograph in which the minor and the corpse *in situ* form part of the same shot⁷. In any case, the images confirm that minors are shown as internal observers of the aftermath of the attack (they are allowed to see it). Besides, the newspapers resort to them so that the viewer of the image participates in what they are looking at.

We said that after the biennium 79-80 it is appreciated that this mode of representation disappears from the photographs. If until then the minors occupied the frame instead of the victim, now with the photographic record of the deceased the children lose their functions. The reasons could be found in the fact that the corpse becomes the true protagonist, and the presence of the minor no longer has a place. Later (symbols epigraph), a variation will be observed in which minors at the scene of the events acquire a new role: placing a bouquet to determine the space in which the attack took place.

Finally, in the 1990s we witnessed a new form of representation. The image reproduced by El País on June 21st, 1998, on the occasion of the murder of the councilor of the Partido Popular Manuel Zamarreño Villoria in Rentería, is paradigmatic of this procedure. In it, a child can be seen at the scene of the events, who is walking next to some vehicles parked in a battery, and whose eyes are covered by his father's hand. It is striking that the victim's body has already been removed and what is being hidden from him are the remains of the event. Now the minor goes from being the one who is portrayed while he looks directly at the aftermath of the attack to the one who is not allowed to see. By extension, the external spectator is not shown the corpse in situ either. The reason could be found in the awareness of self-censorship that was installed in society in the 1990s and that culminated in the approval of the Law for the Protection of Minors (1/1996), which establishes that the interest of minors is a priority.

3.3.2. The child marks the crime scene

The formulas to fix the place of an attack are going to be diverse depending on the time in which it occurs. Initially, it was a simple cross that fulfilled this mission, over time the number of possible graphic attachments (circles, dolls...) increased, as mentioned in the previous section. Later, people will do it. Sometimes, both mechanisms are used, as in the image published by *El Correo* on April 18th,

⁷ Numerous texts corroborate the presence of minors (usually relatives of the victim) at the scene of the events at the time of the attack. But they do not have their correspondence in images.

⁸ For more information on the situations in which photographs of minors can be taken, see Annex VII of Royal Decree 1720/2007 of December 21st. It can also be consulted (Soriano, 2019, p. 280).

1979. In it, the specific place where the body of the civil guard Juan Bautista García Guipúzcoa was found has been graphically delimited on a road, but also two people signal it. Along these lines, *Egin* inserts on the same day a closer photograph in which those empowered to establish the place of the events are children.

It must be remembered that initially, those who assume this task have a relationship with the event. They are relatives or coworkers of the deceased. Sometimes, it even is the journalist who is collecting the information who is captured by the reporter who accompanies them indicating the exact place. Over time, these figures are replaced by other typologies (porters, walkers...) and this is where minors have a place.

The boy who marks the exact place where the attack on José M^a Piris Carballo took place, the first minor (13 years old) victim of ETA, whose sports bag exploded, stands out, among others. The turning point in the images of *Deia* and *El Correo*, from March 30th, 1980, is that the victim is replaced by another minor who is standing and in profile pointing to the place with his finger. If until now the representation strategy corresponded to the role of a mere spectator in the image, here we can see how, in the absence of the corpse, the minor begins to develop a more active role.

A paradigmatic sample of these signaling modalities is the one that reconfigures the development of an attack by reconstructing it with people unrelated to the event. Thus, on August 31st, 1979, *La Gaceta del Norte* published a photograph in which it places two young people at the place where the national police officer José M^a Pérez Rodríguez died. As a novel aspect, it should be noted that the place where the terrorists were found is also marked with a minor. The caption describes the situation: "This is the scene of the events. In the place where the boy is, the van was prepared with the terrorists inside. It was on the tracks – where the two young boys are – that the national police officer fell mortally wounded."

3.3.3. The witness child

While images are published in which they are placed as internal spectators at the scene of the events or as subjects who mark the scene of the attack, they are also portrayed as witnesses. In this sense, the number of images is scarce, but a significant evolution can be seen, ranging from photographs in which the witness has no relationship with the victim to those in which it is a relative. The spaces in which they are registered also vary (at their house, in a hospital bed, at funerals, at the scene of the events, a passport photo, etc.).

What can be considered the first shot in which the presence of a witness accompanied by minors⁹ is verified corresponds to the attack on two civil guards, Lucio Revilla Alonso and José Rodríguez Lama, on November 11th, 1978 in Villareal de Urrechua. *La Gaceta del Norte* and *El Correo* pick up the news with the image of Juana Iparraguirre as a witness affected by the shock wave of an artifact. *El Correo* resorts to a photograph in which a woman can be seen taking care of two minors. For its part, in *La Gaceta del Norte* we find a more static image of her sitting with a child in her arms, while the caption of the photo describes the situation in greater detail: "Juana Iparraguirre, a resident of a village near the scene of the attack, told us with her grandson in her arms, how the device exploded when she walked about 20 meters away with two milk bottles in her hands". In any case, it is necessary to specify that the shots are taken at her home and do not account for the place where the attack took place.

Received: 17/05/2022. **Accepted:** 04/07/2022. **Published:** 23/07/2022.

⁹ Previously, on December 16th, 1977, *El Correo* inserted a snapshot due to the death of Julio Martínez, councilor of the Irún City Council. In this, the recurring motif was a woman on the threshold of her home with her two children. The justification could be found in the fact that she heard the shots. In any case, we are dealing with a person who can partially witness the event, since she did not see it.

Nor are the images published by *Deia* and *El Correo* on November 5th, 1978, located at the exit of the Berazubi soccer field where the civil guard Mariano Criado Ramajo died from a shot to the neck. Both media insert a shot in which the 13-year-old witness, Jesús Orbegozo, directs his gaze at the camera from the hospital bed where he recovered from the wounds caused by the bullet impacts.

So far, we can conclude that these photographs are limited to personal portraits outside the scope of the event, but with the exception that in the latter case, the minor suffers the consequences of it. Therefore, it can be affirmed that we are facing a new category, that of the witness and survivor child.

In the biennium 79-80 this modality is maintained, but with some changes regarding its location in the frame. This is the case of the attack on José M^a Piris. While *El País* chooses to edit a passport photo of Fernando García, a seriously wounded friend with whom he was, *El Correo* and *Deia* place the witness in the space of the attack (see the epigraph "The boy marks the scene of the events").

Another variation is that the witness is not someone anonymous or a friend (as in the previous one), but a relative. On January 28th, 1979, *Deia* portrays Salvador Ulayar, the youngest son of the former mayor of Etxarri Aranaz, Jesús Ulayar Liciaga. The 13-year-old boy saw five shots fired at his father from a short distance when he was about to help him with a drum. In the shot, which belongs to a later moment, the exit of the coffin from the family home, the minor is in profile on the right side. The caption of the photo describes the moment: "Coffin outside the house. With a sweater, José Ignacio and, to the right, next to the crown, Salvador, the youngest son who saw his father die". In this image there are some changes compared to what was exposed: the frame shows an environment that corresponds to the place of the attack and the beginning of the funeral. In both, the minor has been placed, although we are participants in his quality as a witness through the text. On the other hand, it is necessary to underline that, although it is a specific case, it is the first time that the minor who witnessed the event shared the same space with the body in the coffin.

In this sense, it can also be stated that there is no photograph in which a minor witness coincides with the body *in situ*. If in the previous case we said that it was the printed word that illustrated that moment, it will also do so in the attack on Vicente Irusta Altamira who died in Ibarruri (Vizcaya) on February 7th, 1979, due to three shotgun blasts. The photos published by *La Gaceta del Norte* and *Deia* show the three children who found the body at 9 in the morning the next day when they were on their way to school. In any case, we are not dealing with the witnesses of the attack, but with those who find the lifeless body of the victim, therefore, before an orchestrated composition, since the corpse has been removed.

3.3.4. The child depository of symbols

The symbols that appear in the press photographs of the ETA attacks during the period under study usually correlate with the historical stage in which they take place. For this reason, during the Dictatorship, these will have a marked military character (arms raised, Spanish flags, medals, military caps, etc.). These will be progressively replaced in the Transition by others that adjust more adequately to the political changes.

Special mention is required by the personal objects of the deceased at the time of death that become authentic symbols of their absence and that according to Reyes:

The object is an eyewitness to action, it is like a complete extension of the person itself. The object is the trace or imprint of a personality that remains. Although the person no longer exists, it allows us to look at how he lived, it gives us a way into his private world. The object seen in analytical terms is important

445

RLCS, Revista Latina de Comunicación Social, 80, 435-451 [Research] https://www.doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2022-1814 | ISSN 1138-5820 | Year 2022

because it leads us to someone in particular, to his feelings; even more, it leads us to the drama that divided the life of an individual into a before and an after. (2000, p. 112)

Whether it's their blood, the newspaper they were reading, an unfinished drink, or items from their wardrobe such as a sweater or boots, they are all signs that refer to the deceased. In this sense, Tisseron states that photography has the power to allude to the victim through: "the psychic image of the object that represents it as psychically present while it is perceived as materially absent. These functions correspond in particular to the use of an image to evoke an absent person" (2000, p. 76).

In the biennium 79-80 it is observed that the symbols mentioned are maintained and even acquire dynamism and are given use. This is the case of traditional newspapers that gradually occupy the place of the attack to cover its aftermath. As a novel aspect, and this is where minors have a greater presence, bouquets¹⁰ are incorporated as a fundamental piece in the scene. The precedent can be found in the photographs of May 26th, 1979, inserted by *La Gaceta del Norte* and *El País* after the attack in Madrid on Lieutenant General Jesús Gómez Hortigüela, Colonels Agustín Laso Corral and Jesús Ábalos, and the civilian driver Luis Gómez Borrego. The image shows the new role played by children as repositories of flowers at the scene of the incident when the deceased have been taken to the deposit.

In the 80s there is a stagnation of the symbols mentioned, except for the bouquets. The minors will continue to be in charge of this mission, as in the photograph in *El Correo* of May 8th, 1981, on the occasion of the assassination in Madrid of infantry lieutenant colonel Guillermo Tévar Seco, the escort non-commissioned officer Antonio Nogueras García, and the soldier driver Manuel Rodríguez Taboada. The image, which is in the place where the device that the terrorists placed on the roof of the vehicle in which the victims were found exploded, shows a girl holding hands with her mother and her little brother when laying down the flowers.

Another significant attack in which a similar image is located is that of María Dolores González Cataráin, Yoyes, in Ordizia square (Guipúzcoa). The former ETA leader had gone to a party in her hometown when an individual shot her in the presence of her three-year-old son and another young child. The graphic coverage of this murder turned out to be quite uneven on the part of the different newspapers¹¹. However, in the photographs related to the object of this research, the ones inserted by La Gaceta del Norte, Deia, and El Correo on September 11th, 1986, stand out, in which some children on their bicycles contemplate a bouquet. El País echoes that the festivities were not suspended until three hours after the attack and how: "the bloodstain was covered with sawdust and shortly after the children went through that same place with their bicycles" (Barbería, 1986). On the other hand, it is necessary to underline that, although the moment in which the bouquet is deposited is not recorded, but rather the act of looking at this symbol, a difference is observed compared to previous stages. It goes from the minor who contemplates the remains of the event (pool of blood, destroyed vehicles...) to the one who perceives the response to the attack. The space is the same, but the role differs and the symbolic connotations as well. In the first case, according to Cortés, "in the human body, blood is life, but when it flows from a wound, it mixes and spreads on the ground, with the earth and the dust, it coagulates and corrupts, the blood declares death" (1996, p. 21). Therefore, we are facing a sign closer

-

¹⁰ We are not referring here to the classic flower crowns that had been present in the images of funerals since the beginning in all the newspapers.

¹¹ *El Correo* reproduces a shot on the cover following the usual ones at that time of other attacks, that of the corpse in situ. Specifically, a photograph in which the deceased can be seen in the middle of a pool of blood next to the tractor in which minutes before she had just sat her son down. However, *Deia*, in an obvious setback that refers to the images that were published during the Dictatorship, only inserts a passport-size portrait of the deceased on the cover. For more information on this first example of self-censorship in the 1980s, see (Parejo, 2004).

to the lifeless body. However, in the second it is covered, first with sawdust and then with flowers, to make way for the tribute¹².

4. Conclusions

In this research, we intended to address the transformations in the representation of minors in press photographs of ETA attacks based on the locations in which they are placed, the functions that are given to them, and the frequency with which they are portrayed. We have verified the presence of three spaces: family environments unrelated to the event, funerals, and the scene of the events. From this classification, it can be affirmed that the first photographs correspond to the first of the indicated locations and, therefore, they are not shots taken expressly to illustrate the event, but rather belong to the victim's family album. This gives rise to the insertion of images from the past in which the deceased appears accompanied by one of his children in some commemoration, as could be the precedent of this category that we place in August 1972 (Eloy García's attack).

In 1976 and 1977 we find the first images of minors at the scene and funerals. Concerning this last location, it should be noted that initially, the evolution fluctuates depending on the newspaper. While the newspapers that emerged with the Transition are located at a shorter narrative distance to focus on the display of emotions, the more traditional ones opt for more distant shots. Over time, the images of the latter become similar to those of the former. Also, it is appreciated that the registration formulas evolve towards an attempt to show greater expressive gestures.

Regarding the place of the events, two issues must be noted. The first is related to the various roles that minors acquire. In this sense, we have detected four possibilities: the spectator, the one who signals, the witness, and the depositary of bouquets. If we focus on the first, it can be seen that they range from mere spectators in the image located at the scene of the events with no evidence of this to when they are portrayed next to the corpse covered with a sheet, through those portrayed next to the vehicle or to the pool of blood of the deceased (this is the most frequent). Regarding minors who become an active part and signal the place of the attack, the most common compositions account for a simple mechanism in which they point a finger at the place. A shot in which several children are placed to determine the location of the terrorists and that of the murdered person requires a mention. In the shots of the witnesses, the variety of locations stands out, most of them far from the scene of the events (their home, a hospital, or at the funeral). Furthermore, two modalities are distinguished, in which there is no link between them and the deceased and in which we are dealing with a relative. Finally, the bouquet as a symbol hardly undergoes variations since it is usual for minors to find themselves depositing it and exceptionally contemplate it.

The second question, the frequency with which minors are registered, runs parallel to the prevailing socio-political situation. However, this figure poses some peculiarities and restrictions. We started from the hypothesis that the presence of minors had a cyclical disposition that covered three periods that have been confirmed. The first, until 1976, is characterized by the fact that the few images that are published (from the archive) are not related to the attack, but previous events in the family. The second, until 1980, is when a close link is established since they will gradually be registered at the scene of the events as a key element that will finally play an active role. Moreover, progressively, an increase in the number of photos is observed. As of 1981, their sporadic appearance is identified with a more distant presence in

447

Received: 17/05/2022. **Accepted:** 04/07/2022. **Published:** 23/07/2022.

-

¹² Let us remember that the husband of the deceased asked those attending the funeral to carry a flower. In this way, Deia will portray him on September 12th, 1986 at the head of the funeral.

the frame or with an evident distance from the moment in which the attack took place. In this phase, the insertion of snapshots that collect the act of offering flowers predominates. Finally, in the 1990s, there was a return to a very limited number of images, as in the first period. We find two highly significant possibilities: they are portrayed from the back to preserve their anonymity or in an action that shows that they are not allowed to look, and that confirms a return to the past, although with other connotations. And it is precisely at this point where it is evident that we are facing a cyclical and not a circular narrative (as we have been showing), since the arrival point, although it has close similarities with the origin (disappearance of photographs in which the figure of minors is shown) has different motivations. The censorship of the early years is replaced by self-censorship. On the other hand, the transit of minors is striking as an essential element that easily delimits the precise enclave of the attack to the one who is prohibited from seeing it.

Regarding the restrictions that we mentioned, following the figure of minors, it is necessary to underline that although they and the corpse *in situ* are present separately in numerous frames, they do not coincide in any of them; meanwhile, we found plenty of samples in which the deceased and an adult appear.

5. References

- Alonso, R., Domínguez, F. y García Rey, M. (2010). *Vidas Rotas. Historia de los hombres, mujeres y niños víctimas de ETA*. Fundación Política Española.
- Alonso R. (2005). ETA y la salida del terrorismo. *Cuadernos de Alzate: revista vasca de la cultura e ideas*, 33, 117-137.
- Armentia, J. I., Caminos, J. M., Marín, F. y Ganzabal, M. (2012). *El tratamiento de las muertes de ETA en la prensa vasca (1990-2010)*. Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del País vasco.
- Avilés, J. (2010). El terrorismo en España: de ETA a al Qaeda. Arco Libros.
- Barbería, J. L. (1986, 11 de septiembre). Asesinada en Ordizia la exdirigente "etarra" "Yoyes" un año después de acogerse a la reinserción. *El País*. https://elpais.com/diario/1986/09/11/espana/526773609 850215.html
- Barthes, R. (2004). La cámara lúcida. Paidós.
- Benjamin, W. (1973). La obra de arte en su época de reproductibilidad técnica. En: *Discursos Interrumpidos 1*. Taurus.
- Berganza Conde, M. R, y Ruiz San Román, J. A. (2010). Investigar en comunicación. McGraw Hill.
- Bordieu, P. (2003). *Un arte medio*. Gustavo Gili.
- Caminos-Marcet, J. M., Armentia-Vizuete, J. I. y Marín-Murillo, M. F. (2013). Los diarios vascos frente al terrorismo (1990, 2000, 2008 y 2009). Análisis de los editoriales sobre los atentados mortales de ETA. *Revista Latina De Comunicación Social*, 68, 1-26. https://doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2013-967
- Casetti, F. y Di Chio, F. (2007). Cómo analizar un film. Ediciones Paidós.

- Castresana, G. (1987, 29 de junio). Con Dios y con el diablo. *El País*. https://elpais.com/diario/1987/06/29/espana/551916003-850215.html
- Cortés, J. M. (1996). El cuerpo mutilado: la angustia de la muerte. Edicions Alfons el Magnànim.
- Domínguez, F. (2007). La ruptura de la tregua y la situación del terrorismo de ETA. *Cuadernos de pensamiento político FAES*, 14, 31-37.
- Fernández Bañuelos, J. I. (1997). La transición del fotoperiodismo. Un acercamiento a las imágenes de los diarios vizcaínos durante el periodo 1975-1982. Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del País Vasco.
- García-Lafuente, M. (2014). Prensa y terrorismo de ETA en España (1974-1997). Universidad de Valencia.
- García Varela, P. (2022). Los menores de edad víctimas mortales de ETA. Pasado y Memoria. *Revista de Historia Contemporánea*, 24, 322-341, https://doi.org/10.14198/PASADO2022.24.13
- González, F. (2018). ETA: un terrorismo salvaje e inútil. Actualidad jurídica Uria Menéndez, 48, 7-10.
- Hidalgo, Sara (2018): La primera víctima. *Revista Grand place: pensamiento y cultura*, 9, 157-159. https://marioonaindiafundazioa.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/GRAND-PLACE-09_interactivo.pdf
- Marcos, M. (2021). ETA catódica. Terrorismo en la ficción televisiva. Editorial Laertes.
- Marcos, M. (2011). Cine documental sobre ETA: una mirada a la realidad. *Fotocinema: revista científica de cine y fotografía*, 3, 58-75. https://doi.org/10.24310/Fotocinema.2011.v0i3.5870
- Miguel-Sáez de Urabain, A. y Moreno Gallo, M. A. (2015) ¿Cese definitivo de la actividad armada o fin del terror? La declaración del fin de la violencia de ETA en la portada de los diarios españoles, Estudios sobre el Mensaje Periodístico, 21(2), 1111-1128.
- Morera Hernández, C. (2021) La representación de ETA en la prensa española: el terrorismo en portada (1973-1998). *Revista General de Información y Documentación*, 31(2), 735-755. https://dx.doi.org/10.5209/rgid.79466
- Parejo, N. (2004). Fotografía y muerte: Representación gráfica de los atentados de ETA (1968-1997). Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del País Vasco.
- Parejo, N. (2008). El espectador en la imagen versus el Espectator. *Revista Doxa*, 6, 140-162. https://doi.org/10.31921/doxacom.n6a5
- Reinares, F. (2018). Terrorismo: de ETA a la yihad. En: González, E., Rubio, R. y Pendás, B. (coord.) España constitucional (1978-2018): trayectorias y perspectivas (pp. 2882-2892). Centro de Estudios Políticos y Constitucionales.
- Reyes, F. (2000). Fetiches de la infamia. Fetiches de la luz. Revista Exit, 1, 112-127.

Soriano, T. (2019). Ayúdame a mirar. La biblia del reportaje gráfico. Grupo Anaya.

Tisseron, S. (2000). La imagen funámbula o la sensación en la fotografía. *Revista Papel Alpha*, 2, 71-94.

Veres, L. (2021). El terrorismo de ETA y el espacio de la perpetración: el caso de la casa cuartel de Vic. *Revista Perspectivas de la Comunicación, 14*(2), 7-30. https://www.scielo.cl/scielo.php?script=sci arttext&pid=S0718-48672021000200007

Vicente, A. M. (2020). Cine documental sobre ETA. *Revista de criminología, psicología y ley*, 3, 100-128. https://cripsiley.usal.es/wp-content/uploads/sites/46/2021/12/116-145_Vicente_Vicente_Ana_Mari%CC%81a. Cine documental sobre ETA.pdf

Wollheim, R. (1987). La pintura como arte. Trustees of the National Galery of Art.

AUTHOR/S:

Nekane Parejo

Universidad de Málaga

Professor of the Department of Audiovisual Communication at the Universidad de Málaga and the Interuniversity Doctorate in Communication at the Universities of Cádiz, Huelva, Málaga, and Seville. She teaches classes in the University Master's Degree in Cinematography at the Universidad de Córdoba, the Master's Degree in Audiovisual Creation and Performing Arts at the Universidad de Málaga, and the Master's Degree in Digital and Audiovisual Communication at the Instituto de Estudios Cajasol in Seville. She has directed 10 theses at 3 different universities and has 3 six-year research periods. Since its foundation in 2010, she has been the director of the journal *FOTOCINEMA*. Revista científica de cine y fotografía: http://www.revistas.uma.es/index.php/fotocinema/index

Her research is focused on the relationship between cinema and photography and their history. She is the author of 4 books and more than 50 scientific publications. nekane@uma.es

Índice H: 7

Orcid ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3021-1223

Scopus ID: https://www.scopus.com/authid/detail.uri?authorId=56200205400

Google Scholar: https://scholar.google.com/citations?user=CK5aVggAAAAJ&hl=es

Dialnet: https://dialnet.unirioja.es/metricas/investigadores/1801105 **Publons:** https://publons.com/researcher/3770772/nekane-parejo/

Agustín Gómez Gómez

Universidad de Málaga

Professor at the Universidad de Málaga. His research work is centered on rural cinema, the film-art relationship, and the cinema of the self. He has coordinated three Film and Art courses organized by the Fundación Picasso of Malaga. Regarding rural cinema, he has participated in three R+D+i projects. On the cinema of the self, he has published works on Pedro Almodóvar, Wim Wenders, Manoel de Oliveira, Agnès Varda, Elías León Siminiani, Albertina Carri, and Marc Recha. He has given more than fifty lectures, some at international universities: Oxford University, Aston University (Birmingham), Freie

RLCS, Revista Latina de Comunicación Social, 80, 435-451 [Research] https://www.doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2022-1814 | ISSN 1138-5820 | Year 2022

Universität Berlin, University of Münster, Université Paris 8, Université Paris-Est Marne-la-Vallée, Università di Torino, Universidade Lusófona do Porto, Università Sacre Cuore in Rome, Blas Pascal in Córdoba (Argentina). He has supervised 10 doctoral theses.

aggomez@uma.es

Índice H: 6

Orcid ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1736-0630

Scopus ID: https://www.scopus.com/authid/detail.uri?authorId=57056027600 **Google Scholar:** https://scholar.google.es/citations?user=V-drarYAAAAJ&hl=es

Dialnet: https://dialnet.unirioja.es/metricas/investigadores/15726

Publons: https://publons.com/researcher/3770664/agustin-gomez/metrics/

Received: 17/05/2022. **Accepted:** 04/07/2022. **Published:** 23/07/2022.